



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 16, 2004

Mr. Luz E. Sandoval Walker
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2004-10679

Dear Mr. Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 214905.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for "any police/arrest/incident reports" involving a named individual. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Information is protected from disclosure by the common-law right to privacy when (1) it is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and (2) there is no legitimate public interest in its disclosure. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976).

Where an individual's criminal history information has been compiled by a governmental entity, the information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right to privacy. *See United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989). In this instance, the requestor seeks access to unspecified criminal records involving a named individual. Thus, the request requires the department to compile information relating to this individual. Based on the reasoning set out in *Reporters*

Committee, we conclude that such a compilation implicates the specified individual's right to privacy to the extent that it includes information where the named individual was a criminal suspect, arrestee, or defendant. Accordingly, we conclude that to the extent the department maintains responsive information that reveals that the specified individual was a criminal suspect, arrestee, or defendant, such information must be withheld from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy as set out in *Reporters Committee*.

You claim that the information in Exhibit E is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. This section provides in pertinent part as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You state that the submitted information in Exhibit E involves an investigation of an allegation of child abuse or neglect. We find, however, that the submitted information does not contain a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under chapter 261 of the Family Code or any information used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 or in providing services as a result of such an investigation. *See* Fam. Code § 261.001(1) (defining "abuse"), (4) (defining "neglect"). We therefore conclude that the department may not withhold any of the submitted information in Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

We note, however, that the submitted information in Exhibit E is subject to section 58.007 of the Family Code. The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Open Records Decision No. 644 (1996). Upon review, we find that the information in Exhibit E involves juvenile conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, this information is confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, and it must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

The remaining submitted information includes a social security number. A social security number is confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), if a governmental body obtained or maintains the social security number under any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 at 2-4 (1994). We have no basis for concluding that the social security number at issue is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I) and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act ("Act") imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Therefore, before releasing the marked social security number, the department should ensure that this number was not obtained and is not maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Finally, the remaining submitted information contains information that is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a Texas motor vehicle driver's license and information relating to a Texas motor vehicle title or registration. Gov't Code § 552.130. Thus, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130.

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions like section 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, to the extent the department maintains responsive information that reveals that the specified individual was a criminal suspect, arrestee, or defendant, such information must be withheld from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy as set out in *Reporters Committee*. The department must withhold the information in Exhibit E under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. The social security number we have marked may be excepted from disclosure under federal law. The department must withhold the marked Texas driver's license number pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/seg

Ref: ID# 214905

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Sheri Dean
Sheri Y. Dean & Associates
18333 Egret Bay Boulevard, Suite 580
Houston, Texas 77058
(w/o enclosures)